to change it. But, I would like to say that we are doing it under the commitments which were made in the past.

SHRI MOHAMMED AMIN: Sir, some cases of freedom fighters for pension are still pending with the Home Ministry of the Government of India. And it is very difficult to understand what the reason for this inordinate delay in taking a decision is. For example, I had brought to tnelir notice one case of Shri Jeevan Goha. He was a freedom fighter and he took part in the 1942 movement. At present, he is in a very serious disaressing condition ailing at Calcutta. I personally know this case and on the 10th of February, I wrote a letter to the Home Minister enclosing documents to prove that he was a freedom fighter. I received a reply also. But, no decision has yet •been taken. Will the Minister be pleased to say that this will be considered by her?

SMT. MARGARET ALVA: As I said earlier, the Ministry of Personnel does not handle freedom fighters' pension directly. But I shall take the details from the hon. Member and personally follow it up with the Home Ministry... (In *terrup tions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: As Minister of Public Grievances, she has taken it up.

SMT. MARGARET ALVA: Yes, as Minister of Public Grievances I am prepared to take the papers from the hon. Minister, and follow it up.

*323. [*The questioner (.Shri S. S. Ahluwalia)* was absent. For answer Vide Col..... infra]

Export orders bagged by BHEL

324. SHRI RAJNI RANJAN SAHU:†

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Rajni Ranjan Sahu.

SHRIMATI VEENA VERMA: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) the export orders bagged by BHLL inis year indicating the increase in the number of equipment to De exported;

(b) what is the rupee value of such exports and aiso in foreign exchange terms during 1992-93?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISIRY OF INDUSTRY I DPARTMENT OF INDUSTRIAL DriVEiA)PMENT) WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY (DEPARTMENT OF HEAVY INDUSTRY) (SHRIMATI KRISHNA SAHI): (a) BHEL has begged export orders from seven countries during this year as against four in the previous year.

(b) THE value of the export orders baged during 1992-93 is Rs. 227 crores approximately (US$ 71 million approximately).

SHRI RAJNI RANJAN SAHU: Sir, the BHEL., with over 73,000 strong work-force including 11,000 highly qualified engineers has after three decades of their effective and fruitful struggle made a prominent place in the world market. But I am sorry to say, Sir, that the export orders are declining. In 1988-89, they were Rs. 276 crores, in 1989-90, Rs. 381 crores, in 1990-91, Rs. 490 crores and, as per the reply in 1992-93, they were only Rs. 227 crores. This is very alarming. I would like to know from the honourable Minister while are the main products of BHEL in demand abroad, that is, country-wise and which of them have a demand in the developed world including the European countries.

Secondly, I would also like to know which are the main equipments in demand abroad and whether they include power equipment also and what their value is in terms of dollars.

**श्रीमती कृष्णा साही** : सभापति महोदय, भारत सरकार के संसाधनों में कमी के कारण बाइलेट्रल फंडिंग आफ प्रोजेक्ट की मात्रा में वृद्धि हो रही है और इससे विदेशी कम्पनियों के कार्य का हिस्सा बढ़ा है एवं भेल का भाग घट रहा है। यह सही बात है। परन्तु रेमेडियल स्टेप्स लिये गये है और रेमेडियल स्टेप्स इसलिए लिये जा रहे है कि विद्युत उपकरणों के लिए 8वीं और 9वीं योजनाओं में ध्येय की पूर्ति हेतु मार्किटिंग ड्राइव चलाया गया है और विद्युत उत्पादन के लिए निजी और सार्वजनिक दोनों क्षेत्रों में संघ व्यवस्था स्थापित करके बिड्स के जरिये प्रसिद्ध कम्पनियों के साथ संयुक्त कार्य किया जा रहा है। पुराने उपकरणों से लाइफ एक्सटेंशन, रिनावेशन और मोडेर्नाइजेशन के माध्यम से विद्युत केन्द्रों के कारोबार में सुधार किया जा रहा है। भारत विदेशों में नये विद्युत केन्द्रों के आर्डर प्राप्त करने हेतु परियोजनाओं के फंडिंग की स्थापना का पता लगा रहा है और नये इनरजाटक विकास क्षेत्रों में विवादीकरण के माध्यम से जहां भेल की एवेजाटिंग इनफ्रास्ट्रक्चरल सुविधा है, स्किल तथा क्षमताओं का लाभकारी उपयोग हो सके और स्थिति में सुधार लाने के लिए ऊर्जा विभाग से विमर्श किया जा रहा है कि किस प्रकार से भेल की क्षमताओं का उपयोग किया जा सके।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please put your second supplementary.

SHRI RAJNI RANJAN SAHU: Thank you, Madam, for your reply. NoW I come to my second supplementary. The BHEL has developed sophisticated technologies including those for nuclear power plants, gas-based plants, large-sized thrystor devices. In the light of this I would like to know from the honourable Minister the Government's policy and also wnether it is oriented towards imports substitution and exportable items with high R&D inputs and, if so ... *(Interruptions)* ...

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह** : बिहार के होकर भी आप अंग्रेजी म बोल रहे हैं। हिन्दी में बोलिये... **(व्यवधान)**।

**श्री रजनी रंजन साहू** : भेल का मामला है। अंग्रेजी में टक्निकल टर्म्स है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please leave the language to the Member... *(Interruptions)* ...

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह** : हिन्दी में तो बोल ही सकते है।

SHRI RAJNI RANJAN SAHU: I should be sympathetic and not you... *(Interruptions)* ... The Minister can understand it very well. You don't worry... *(Interruptions)*... He is disturbing me, Sir.

Sir I would lik$_e$ to know from the honourable Minister whether it is oriented towards import substitution and exportablr items with high R&D inputs and, if so, the percentags of allocation and expenditure for R&D programme during 1991-92 and 1992-93 and what is proposed for 1993-94. Unless the R&D is improved, I do not think that this export percentage will go up. I would like to put my simple question to the Minister whether R&D arrangements are to be made by the BHEL.

**श्रीमती कृष्णा साही** : महोदय, उन्होंने पूछा था कि भेल का मुख्य एक्सपोर्ट क्या है? इसका मुख्य एक्सपोर्ट पावर जेनरेशन एक्वीपमेंट के लिए है। इन्होंने पूछा था कि विदेश में क्या काम हो रहा है, तो मैं कहना चाहती हूं कि प्राप्त किये गये प्रमुख निर्यात आदेश साइप्रस और माल्टा से 130 करोड़ रुपये मूल्य के टर्बो-जनरेटर सेटों के प्रमुख निर्यात आदेश पूरे होने वाले है। इसके अतिरिक्त मलेशिया के साथ विद्युत संयंत्र प्रसारण उपकरण... **(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is on R & D.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The question is related to R & D, not to exports.

**श्रीमती कृष्णा साही**: आर एंड डी एक्विपमेंट का 42 करोड़।

**श्री दीपेन घोष**: इन्हें हिन्दी में क्वेश्चन करना चाहिये था।

**श्री रजनी रंजन साहू**: सीधा सवाल है। हिन्दी में समझना है तो मैं बताता हूं कि सब्सिटयूशन आफ आर. एंड डी. के बारे में मैंने पूछा है। इसका जवाब मुझे मिल गया है।

**श्री दीपेन घोष**: आपने अंग्रेजी में सवाल पूछा, इसलिये जवाब नहीं दिया। हिन्दी में पूछते तो जवाब मिलता।

**श्रीमती वीणा वर्मा**: मैं माननीय मंत्री महोदया से पूछना चाहती हूं कि जो "भेल द्वारा थाइरिस्टार टाइप के इंजन डेवलप किये गये है बाहर उनका बहुत सारा मार्केट है और हम इसको इम्पोर्ट भी कर रहे है और इम्पोर्ट करने के लिये सरकार और ज्यादा कोशिश कर रही है। तो क्या बाहर भेजने की पासिबिलटीज आफ हाई पावर थाइरिस्टार इंजन हैव बीन डेवलप्ड, तो हमारे क्या एफर्ट्स हैं, हम किस तरफ बढ़ रहे है और हमको कितने एक्सपोर्ट के आर्डर्स प्राप्त हुए है, थाइरिस्टार इंजनों के ?

**श्रीमती कृष्णा साही**: सभापति महोदय,

**एक माननीय सदस्य**: यह रेलवे मिनिस्टर का सवाल है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please do not disturb. Let the Minister answer. It is very difficult for her to out-shout you.

**श्रीमती कृष्णा साही**: सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्या पुनः प्रश्न करें क्योंकि मैं ठीक से समझ नहीं पायी

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please repeat the substance of your question.

SHRIMATI VEENA VERMA: Sir, I want to know whether the Thyristor type of engines developed by BHEL have an expanding market abroad whether we are still thinking of importing similar high-powered engines, and whether the possibilities of developing high-powered engines have been examined.. .

**श्रीमती कृष्णा साही**: यह रेलवे से संबंधित है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. G. G. Swell.

SHRI P. UPENDRA; Sir, I would like to enlighten the Minister. BHEL has produced a proto-type of 5,000 HP Thyristor locomotives which the Railways are not taking. Is there any possibility.....

MB. CHAIRMAN: 1 will come to you. Now Mr. Swell. (*Interruptions)*

**श्रीमती वीणा वर्मा**: यह तो "भेल" द्वारा बनाया हुआ इंजन है।

SHRIMATI KRISHNA SAHI: I am sorry, Sir. BHEL is trying But it has not vet got any export orders for Try-istor type of engines.-

SHR G. G. SWELL: Mr. Chairman, Sir, if you look at the replies to the two questions, the first one is that our export has increased to seven countries from four countries. Well, in terms of foreign exchange earned, it is Rs. 227 crores. There is nothing saying about the earning in the previous year, as has been said In the first question that is, increased to seven from four in the previous year. The omission is significant. I would

like to know from the Minister whether our own Government is orphaning BHEL—orphaning BHEL. I hope the Minister understands the meaning of the word 'orphaning'.

**श्री प्रमोद महाजन : यह कल्याण मंत्रालय से संबंधित है।**

SHRI G. G. SWELL; I would like to know whether her Minstry has objected, has taken a serious note of the fact that the Railways preferred to procure the high-powered engines from a foreign company the Asea Brown Boveri, despite the fact that the BHEL has proved its capacity to manufacture this kind of engines and also has offered a lower rate.

**श्री अजीत जोगी : केसरी जी बतायेंगे .(व्यवधान)**

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I do not want to say that this is against the interests of the Railways. That I want to say is whether her Ministry has objected to it whether she has taken it up seriously and whether she is satisfied with the reasons given by the Railway Ministry.

**श्रीमती कृष्णा साही : सभापति महोदय, पहले ही बताया जा चुका है कि टोटल एक्सपोंट ..(व्यवधान)**

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Why does the Prime Minister not get up and say?'

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is... *(Interruptions)...*

**श्री रजनी रंजन साहू : उनको जवाब तो देने दीजिये (व्यवधान)**

MR. CHAIRMAN: The question is whether you have taken up the-issue. .. *(Interruptions)* .,,

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir generally the Prime Minister is chivalrous. He always comes to the rescue of ladies. Why not in this case, Sir?

THE PRIME MINISTER SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO): Sir, this time I am coming to the rescue of something which is seen as an orphan. There is no orphaning. The mighty Government, the Government of India, is the parent of the BHEL. So long as we are there there is no question of orphaning the BHEL.. There has been some controversy in regard to the purchase of an engine. It lis going on back and forth. Probably, some decisions would have to be taken or have been taken, I do not know... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What did the parents do for their children?

SHRI P.V. NARASIMHA RAO: parents also have to look to the interests of all the children. All the children, not BHEL only.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: ABB is hot a child of an Indian parent. It is a foreign company. The BHEL is an Indian company owned by the Gov-ernmet of India.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RA0: On the specific question... *(Interrup-tions.)* ...

SHR P. UPENDRA: Sir, *Mtr.* Swell's question and my question have not been answered by the Prime Minister. The question is, the BHEL has produced a prototype of 5000 HP electric locomotive with Thyristor technology which the Railways are not accepting. They are trying to import a 6000 HP locomotive from the ABB. Will the Minister or the Prime Minister protect the BHEL and see that the BHEL's prototype is accepted by the Railways?

SHRI P.V. NARASIMHA RAO: I think the question of protecting the BHEL against any undue competition is always there. That protection will *he* available. There are the overall interests of the Railways, of the country beyond which we cannot go. Within these limits, this protection will be available. This is a well-known policy of the Goverment *ot*

India. For decades and decades, we have been following it.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: The BHEL's locomotive costs Rs. 4 crores only. They are trying to import the same at Rs. 45 crores.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Government's answer is, it is because of compertative advantage.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I was asking whethe-they are satisfied with the reasons provided by the Railways... *(Interruptions)* .. .My specific question to the hon. Minister is whether she is satisfionl with,-the reasons given by the Railways

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please listen to the Prime Minister.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: This digression is totally unnecessary. The information is available, has to be available with the Railways. We have no problem in giving the infor mation to the House. But the ques tion which has been put here lis not directly linked with a particular engine having been bought or not having been bought. I do not think we should confuse the issue. If the hon. Members want .....

AN HON. MEMBER: Discussion?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: No, not discussion. If the hon. Members want full details to be given in regard to the engines they are talkdng about, this information is available and it can be given.

MR. CHAIRMAN; Information will be givn by the Government. That is the answer. Now, Mr. V. M. Patel.

SHRI VITHALBHAI M. PATEL: No, Sir

ME. CHAIRMAN: But you have been rvising the hand all the time..

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: sir, I . would like to know the iurn-over ot BHEL in the last three years; and whetner it has ome down. If *so,* what, are the reasons? Most of the anciliiaries of the BHEL are closed in Bangarore. None of them is working because no orders are issued to BHEL It is the perception of the people teat the Government of india is, trying to privatise BHEL indirectly Dy not giving sufficient orders, whether it is in regard to electric engines or railway ay engines, and this perception is confirmed by the facts. Therefore, I would like to know as DO what the policy of the Government is with regard to BHEL. The Prime Ministe, ass— ed protection but the facts are contrary. BHEL is losing its business been use of unfavourable attitude of the Government; in a way.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: It is not true. There is no question of scuttling BHEL or weakening it. It is one of our prestigious units and we wo old certainly like to give all the protection it needs under the policy". Whatever is the general policy from time to time, that policy would toe followed and no protection would be withdrawn or withheld.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: श्रीमन 1992–93 की जानकारी मांगी गयी है। मैं पूछना चाहता हूं कि 1992–93 में इम्पोर्ट पर कितना खर्च किया और एक्सपोर्ट में कितना कमाया, इनका डिफरेंस क्या है। मेरी जानकारी में है कि इम्पोर्ट के खर्च में बी. एच. ई. एल. के ज्यादा होते हैं और एक्सपोर्ट से फायदा कम होता है। मैं लम्बा नहीं पूछना चाहता हूं सिर्फ यह पूछना चाहता हूं कि 1992–93 के दौरान इम्पोर्ट में जो फारेन एक्सचेंज खर्च की और एक्सपोर्ट से जो गेन की, उसका डिफरेंस क्या है ?

श्रीमती कृष्णा साही : सभापति महोदय, बी. एच. ई. एल. को 1992–93 में 7 देशों से 227 करोड़

मूल्य के 13 निर्यात आदेश प्राप्त हुए हैं जबकि 1991-92 में 4 देशों से 277 करोड़ रुपये के 15 निर्यात आदेश प्राप्त हुए हैं।

**श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर** : देयर इज नो रिप्लाई। मैंने पूछा है कि डिफरेंस क्या है?

**श्री बीरेन घोष**: कितना फारेन एक्सचेंज खर्च किया है?

**श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर**: महोदय मेरा सवाल यह है कि 1992-93 में जितना माल बी.एच.ई.एल. ने इम्पोर्ट किया है उसका खर्च जो आपने फारेन एक्सचेंज में दिया है वह कितना है और जो हमने माल बेचा है उसमें कितना आया है, इनका डिफरेंस कितना है?

SHRIMATI KRISHNA SAHI; Total FE outgo including import is worth about Rs. 700 -crores approximate.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR; And exports? Sir, I asked the difference between the two.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: This is not a fair question. Imports are made 'lor our own manufacturing purpose, for the purpose of the country when imports pre necessary for doing all this and if we are exporting something, it should be something we should be proud of. We do not offset imports against exports.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: I amonly asking about the difference during 1992-93.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: It is like asking ten caps to toe subtracted from 40 coats...

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: I only asked for figures of exports land imports during 1992-93. That is all.

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज** : 1992-93 में "भेल" ने कितनी विदेशी मुद्रा कमायी और कितनी विदेशी मुद्रा गंवायी, इसका अंतर पूछ रहे हैं। केवल इसका अंतर पूछा है . . . (व्यवधान)

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, i'f it is only dry figures,—imports and export—if that is what is wanted the figures are already there. But what I am submitting is that you are not taking about a Government. You are talking about a manufacturing concern, a manufacturing unit. In that case, this kind of comparison is not correct because it is our own unit. (Interruptions) Whatever is needed for import, it would have to be given. *(Interruptions')*

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: We are asking for the difference only. That is all.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: If two figures have been given, the difference is obvious. (Interruptions)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: She has not given the figures.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: She has given. *(Interruptions)* She has already given the figures *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: I am only asking the difference between the two.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: The export figures are given in the public sector enterprises' report. The figures for 1991-92 are there. For the year 1992-93, as the year has not ended, it will not be there. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: How much have they exported? What is the order? *(Interruptions)* This is a specific question. (Interruptions)

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री : अगर आंकड़े हैं तो दें।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : आप दोनों आंकड़े दीजिए। यह नहीं दे रहे हैं। वह एक आंकड़ा दे रहे हैं।

SHM JAGDISH PRASAD MA-THUR What is the difference? Is it *un th*e debit side or on the credit side? During the period, have we incurred a loss or it is a gain? What is die difference. That is all. *(Inter-rruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: The hon. Minis-ter will try to give this. Have you information?

SHRIMATl KRISHNA SAHI: I have already said. *(Interruptions)* The exports were Rs. 634 crores and F. E. outgo including imports were about Rs. 700 crores approximate. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: This is in respect of the orders received. Sir, she hlas not given information in regard to the orders executed. Let her say that. *(Interruptions)* . How many of these orders were executed during that period? *(Interruptions)*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : अगर दोनों आंकड़े हैं तो दीजिए। आप मंत्री जी को बताने को कहते क्यों नहीं ?

SHRIMATI KRISHNA SAHI: In 1991-92, exports were Rs. 634 crores and F.E. outgo including imports were about Rs. 700 crores approximate.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Dayanand Siahay. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DAYANAND SAHAY: Sir, I 'fully agree with the Prime Minister that there is no question of finishing the BHEL. But my question is how many times the BHEL has let "down the country? About this purchase of heavy duty loco-engines, the Railway Convention Committee had put a direct question to the Chairman of the BHEL: "Will the BHEL agree, to accept 6000 H. P. loco-engine orders on the same basis, on the same terms and conditions, as the ABB has offered to accept?' They sard 'No . Therefore, I s;ay thai the BHEL has let down the country and allowed this huge order to go to ABB. *(Interruptions)* .

*SURI* JAGESH DESAI: This is not correct. He is denigrating the public sector. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your question? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DAYANAND SAHAY: I say that the BHEL has let down the country on matters of loco-engine orders.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is not a question. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. S. SWELL: The public sector undertaking have let down the country. Let them say that. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Gujral. *(Interruptions)* Please allow the hon. Member to put the question.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL' Sir, the anxiety is on two counts. One, that the General Electric multinational has recently said and it is on record that negotiations for the acquisition of BHEL have re-ached a very advanced stage. I would like to ask if it is a fact. Secondly because of the possible negotiations or which are going on, which have not been contradicted by the Government, is it a fact that the order book of the BHEL has now reached a red line? There is every posibility that soon they will be having nothing to execute primarily because of the new economic policy which emphasises more on import than on local manufacture .

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: Sir, I would like to categorically state that there is no question of allowing

any take-over of the BHEL. Regar ding proposals for collaboration, BHEL has not been having collaborations today for the first time, they have been having collaborations with other companies in other countries for a long period and that is a matter which has to be gone into. Every collaboration agreement or proposal view of the BHEL and from the point has to be gone into from the point of view of the BHEL and from the point of virw of general benefit to the' country. But so far as take-over is concerned whoever might say, whatever he might say, the Govern ment of India will not allow any total take-over of the BHEL.

AN HON. BEMBER: It is not a total take-over, it is a partial takeover^

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: What about the order book?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:This is where one has to assess the capacity of a public sector unit. When order book goes down, there are many reasons. It is quite possi ble that the reasons lie within the unit, it is possible that the reasons lie outside the country, because when there is a recession order books of every supplier go dry. This is quite clear. So, we will have to go toto the details of why the order book of the BHEL has been dwind ling, if it has been dwindling, but that would certainly require a separate question. There is no difficulty in going into it and giving it to you.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: Here I agree with the Prime Minister, but the point is, the order book is going down not because of the recession outside, it is because you are importing recession, in the sense that you are placing more orders for generators and rail engines from outside than on the BHEL. May I ask the Prime Minister if he will kindly order some enquiry into this and see that the BHEL comes out of the red?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: This is a very sweeping kind of allegation. In every transaction all the details are gone into. If it is the judgement of the Government or of the authority that import is going to be in the long-run better for the country, then that course is restorted to. As far as possible there is no need for import if it is not found to be absolutely necessary in a case and that is the policy we have been following.

I will cerainly go toto why the order book has been dwindling, for what reasons. That can be gone into, but let us not make a general statement or a generalised statement without going into each item.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Next Question. SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: Sir,... *(Interruptions).*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Make it very brief.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Sir, you have gone to the next question.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHAND RAN; Sir, you have gone to the other question. Unnecessarily our time is wasted.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: Whether it is necessary or not, for that the Chair is there.

MR. CHAIRMAN; Please come to your point.

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : सभापति महोदय, मैं प्रधान मंत्रीजी से जानना चाहूंगा कि कितने हमारे बिजली बोर्ड और दूसरे लोग जो पहले आर्डर देते थे, पिछले तीन वर्षों में उन्होंने बी.एच.ई.एल. को आर्डर नहीं दिए और वह विदेश से मंगा रहे हैं, इसके बारे में जानकारी दी जाएगी ?

श्री पी. वी. नरसिंह राव : जानकारी दी जाएगी और मैं यह भी कहना चाहूंगा कि उन्होंने क्यों नहीं दिये इसके

बारे में भी हमें देखना पड़ेगा क्योंकि यहां परफार्मेंस का भी सवाल होता है उनकी जल्दी का सवाल होता है, उनकी जो अर्जेंसी होती है उसका भी सवाल होता है। यह कोई एकतरफा सवाल बिल्कुल नहीं है।

**श्री चतुरानन मिश्र** : मैं इसे एक-तरफा बिल्कुल नहीं कह रहा हूं।

**उर्वरक राज-सहायता के संबंध में नियंत्रक महालेखापरीक्षक का प्रतिवेदन**

*325 **श्री अमरराम जायसवाल** : क्या प्रधान मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या यह सच है कि भारत के नियंत्रक-महालेखापरीक्षक ने वर्ष 1991–92 के अपने वार्षिक प्रतिवेदन में कहा है कि उर्वरक राज सहायता उत्पादकों की जेब भरने का उपकरण बनी हुई है;

(ख) यदि हां, तो इस संबंध में ब्यौरा क्या है;

(ग) क्या नियंत्रक-महालेखापरीक्षक ने उक्त प्रतिवेदन में यह भी कहा है कि उर्वरक उत्पादन इकाइयों को राजसहायता के भुगतान के लिए लागत संबंधी उन आंकड़ों पर ध्यान नहीं दिया गया जिनके आधार पर ही राजसहायता की रकम तय की जाती है;

(घ) क्या 103.22 करोड़ रुपए की राज-सहायता के अनावश्यक भुगतान के मामले पकड़े गए हैं;

(ङ) यदि हां, तो उनका ब्यौरा क्या है और क्या सरकार ने इस संबंध में कोई कार्यवाही की है; और

(च) यदि हां, तो उसका ब्यौरा क्या है और यदि नहीं तो उसके क्या कारण है ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS (SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO): (a) to (f) A statement is laid on the Table of *the* House.

**Statement**

(a) and (b) No such observation has been made in the said Report, although the Report does draw attention to some instances of avoidablel excess payments of susidy.

(c) The Report of the C and AG does observe that the Fertilizer Industry Coordination Committee (FICC) did not independently verify cost data on production of fertilizers which forms the basis for fixation of retention prices. However, it may be stated that after obtaining the cost data from the fertilizer units in the prescribed form duly testified by a practising Chartered/Cost Accountant, the FICC Office carries out necessary verifications and cross checks before finalising the retention prices. Moreover, the retention price$_s$ are determined on the basis of a combination of norms and actuals in respect of various elements of cost and not on the basis of actual cost of production.

(d) to (f) The amount of Rs. 103.22 crores has been computed by • the C and AG based on the difference between the tax Utility taken into i account in computing retention prices and the actual payment of tax by some units. However, as per the guidelines issued by the Ministry of Finance for fixation of prices of industrial products, the rate of corpo-rate tax to be taken into account would as a rule be the statutory rate of corporte tax and not actual payment of corporate tax by the concerned units. The same procedure has been followed in computing retention pri-

**श्री अमरराम जायसवाल** : सभापति जी, वर्तमान व्यवस्था के अनुसार राज सहायता से न तो कोई एक पैसा